



White Slave-girls in Israel

AI Index: MDE 15/017/2000 18 May 2000

ISRAEL

Human Rights Abuses Affecting Trafficked Women in Israel's Sex Industry

Although official statistics are not available, it is widely believed that in the past few years thousands of women, including some girls, from FSU countries have been trafficked to Israel to work in the sex industry. Under Israeli laws, virtually all these women are illegal aliens. They are in Israel without work permits or with false documents, which makes them particularly vulnerable to human rights abuses at the hands of traffickers, pimps and others involved in Israel's sex industry. Amnesty International has received many reports of trafficked women being subjected to various human rights abuses, such as enslavement and other restrictions on their liberty, as well as torture, including rape and other forms of sexual abuse.

Enslavement and deprivation of liberty

Amnesty International has received information indicating that in many instances women trafficked from FSU countries are literally bought and sold for large sums of money, often in auctions where they are purchased by the highest bidder. Some are held in debt bondage where they are forced to work to pay off large sums of money. Some women are kidnapped against their will in FSU countries or are lured to Israel under false pretences, and brought to work in the sex industry. Their "owners" restrict their movements in order to prevent them from leaving. There are many reports of women being imprisoned by their "owners" in locked houses and apartments and prevented from going out unaccompanied. There are also frequent reports of trafficked women's passports and other travel documents being taken away by their "owners" in order to prevent them from leaving the country. In some cases, the misappropriation by "owners" of the women's means of identification is also used to force them into the sex industry.

Violence against trafficked women

Women trafficked to Israel are frequently either threatened with or subjected to violence, including rape and other forms of sexual abuse, particularly if they refuse to have sex with customers or try to escape. There are reports of women being forced to have sex against their will with large numbers of men each day. Traffickers and others working in the sex industry sometimes issue threats against the lives and persons of trafficked women and their families, if they should leave the country and return to their countries of residence, or if they should provide intelligence to law enforcement agencies or testify in criminal prosecutions.

CASES

In the course of its visit to Israel in April and May 1999, an Amnesty International delegation visited Neve Tirza Prison and interviewed several women, including four who were being held in connection with their involvement in the sex industry and were awaiting deportation to FSU countries. As the following cases show, the response of the authorities has frequently compounded the problem by treating trafficked women who are subjected to human rights abuses as criminals and illegal aliens, rather than as victims of these abuses.

All names have been changed to protect the identities of the women involved.

Anna's story

"I don't know the outcome of the trial. I only know that Arthur [the pimp] is at liberty. I talked to him on the phone. When the police arrested us they did not allow us to take our things with us, so they are still there. Arthur knows my address in St Petersburg and my telephone number because he kept my passport. I have a small daughter, eight years old there. He threatened that he would find me in Russia, at home, if I did not do what he wanted me to."

Anna, a 31-year-old physics teacher from St Petersburg in the Russian Federation arrived in Israel on a tourist visa in October 1998. She had been lured to Israel by the promise of a job earning US\$1,000 a month, 20 times her salary in the Russian Federation. The Israeli national who had offered her the job made it clear that she would be involved in the sex industry, but promised her good working conditions. She was completely unprepared for the treatment that awaited her.

Anna was met at the airport and taken to an apartment. Her passport was taken from her and she was locked in the apartment with six other women from FSU countries. She was auctioned twice. On the second occasion she was bought for US\$10,000 and taken to work in Haifa, where she was held together with two other women. The apartment in which she was held had bars on the windows. The women were rarely allowed to leave the apartment and never allowed out alone. Much of the money that they earned was taken from them in "fines", money extorted from them by their pimps.

In March 1999 Anna was arrested for involvement in prostitution after a police raid on the apartment where she was being held. In court the police alleged that Anna had signed statements admitting to involvement in prostitution -- but all the documents were in Hebrew, a language Anna neither reads nor writes. She later discovered that she had been accused of running a brothel.

Anna was held at the Kishon detention centre for almost a month awaiting deportation. During that time she was not allowed to talk to the Russian Consul. The reason for her detention was apparently that the authorities wanted her to testify against the pimp. But the authorities never told Anna this or asked for her consent to act as a witness.

Tatiana's story

Tatiana arrived in Israel from Belarus in April 1998 on a tourist visa. She had been promised a job working 12 hours a day as a cleaner in a hotel in the resort of Eilat. She was told the job

would pay her enough to support her mother and her six-year-old son.

Tatiana was met in Eilat by a man pretending to be from the hotel where she was to be employed. He took her to a brothel, where she was forced to work in the sex industry against her will and told that she would have to repay her "sale price" and the travel costs.

Tatiana made various plans to escape. She was finally released from the brothel after a police raid -- a friend of hers had contacted the Belarus Consulate who contacted the police. Tatiana was taken into custody as an illegal immigrant and detained in Neve Tirza Prison awaiting deportation.

Three days after her arrest, Tatiana found an anonymous note on her prison bunk threatening to kill her and punish her family if she spoke out about what had happened to her. Tatiana wanted to testify against her captors in Eilat, but she was terrified that if she did so and was returned to Belarus the traffickers would meet her at the airport or come to her home, since they knew all her passport details and the address of her family.

A petition was made to the Chief of Police explaining that if Tatiana had no protection it would be unreasonably dangerous for her to testify in court. He replied that the Israel Police could not guarantee anyone's safety outside Israel and offered only "minimal protection" for Tatiana. She testified in June 1999 and was deported later that same month. Despite her request that she be flown to Poland or Lithuania and then allowed to cross into Belarus by car, the Israeli authorities deported her directly to Belarus. She was reportedly met by a male relative and taken to an unknown location. Tatiana's fate after that is unknown.

Valentina's story

"I had a nervous break-down. I wanted to escape from this place and asked a client to help me. He turned out to be one of them and I was beaten up by the owners. There was nowhere to run -- there were bars on the windows and bodyguards all the time, day and night."

Valentina, a 27-year-old psychologist and a social worker, arrived in Israel in August 1998 from Moldova. She believed she was going to work as a company representative. Her travel and visa were arranged by the Israeli national who had offered her the job.

Valentina was met at the airport and taken to a hotel. The following day her money, passport and return ticket were taken from her and she was taken to an apartment where she was held for two months.

"The conditions were terrible. One girl was kept to work in the basement for eight months. It was damp there and she got tuberculosis as a result. Most of the girls had different diseases -- venereal and others related to their reproductive organs. I do not wish even to my enemies to go through what we went through."

Valentina eventually succeeded in escaping with another woman by jumping from the first floor of an apartment building. The women returned to the brothel in order to help another friend to escape and were caught up in a police raid on the apartment. Valentina was arrested in March 1999 for not having proper documents or a visa. Although she was pleased that the police had raided the brothel, she was afraid to testify against the man who sold her to the brothel owners because he knew the whereabouts of her family in Ukraine. The Ukrainian

Consul visited her only once following her arrest. Valentina did not know how long the Israeli authorities intended to hold her or when she would be allowed to go home.

Nina's story

"I want to go home but it is possible the trial [of X, the man accused of raping her] may not happen for six months. I also want to make sure that X ... goes to prison." "Deportation orders are not intended for keeping witnesses in detention. Foreigners without permits are only detained so that they leave Israel and do it quickly."

Batya Karmon, head of the Department of Aliens and Visas at the Ministry of the Interior (4)

"She is a criminal. She resided in Israel without a permit. It was obvious that she would not testify if she was not detained."

Moshe Nissan, Haifa Police Spokesperson

Nina, a 19-year-old from Minsk in Belarus, arrived in Israel in late 1998 on a tourist visa. She knew that she would be working in the sex industry, but had been promised good working conditions. After about three months working in a brothel in Haifa, she was abducted at gunpoint, "sold" for US\$1,000, beaten and raped. She escaped and returned to the first brothel in an attempt to earn enough money to pay for her flight back to Belarus.

Nina was arrested by the police in a raid on a massage parlour in Tel Aviv in March 1999. She was imprisoned in Neve Tirza Prison on the basis of a deportation order issued by the Ministry of the Interior. However, even though she had a valid passport and a ticket, she was not deported because the Haifa District Attorney's Office issued an order prohibiting her from leaving Israel to ensure that she testified in a criminal case being brought against the three men who had abducted and raped her. She was finally deported in June 1999 after having been held in Neve Tirza for more than two months.

Nina's plight was brought to the attention of various Israeli officials by the Hotline for Foreign Workers in Detention and reached the pages of the Israeli daily *Yediot Aharonot* in May 1999. Various government officials interviewed by the newspaper denied responsibility for her detention. A prosecutor from the Office of the State Attorney in Haifa commented: "I didn't know that the girl was detained until the Hotline contacted me. I will make every effort to have her finish her testimony in one day so she can be released."

STATE RESPONSIBILITY UNDER INTERNATIONAL HUMAN RIGHTS LAW

Under international human rights law, states are responsible for protecting people against human rights abuses by private persons. Such responsibility is enshrined in all the core human rights treaties. For example, Article 2(1) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) requires a state party to ensure to all individuals within its territory the rights guaranteed in the Covenant, an obligation which, according to the Human Rights Committee, extends to protecting against acts inflicted by people acting in their private capacity.(5) In this connection, under international law, states are required to exercise due diligence in preventing, investigating, prosecuting and providing an effective remedy for human rights abuses committed by private individuals. If the state fails to do so, it will be regarded under international law as having responsibility for these abuses, and therefore deemed to have violated its international obligations.

With respect to the deprivation of liberty, violence and enslavement to which women trafficked to Israel have been subjected, several provisions in international human rights instruments are relevant. Article 7 of the ICCPR, which Israel ratified in 1991, states that no one should be subjected to torture or to cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment. The Human Rights Committee has stated in its General Comment 20, an authoritative interpretation of Article 7 of the Covenant, that "[i]t is the duty of the State party to afford everyone protection through legislative and other measures as may be necessary against the acts prohibited in Article 7, whether inflicted by people acting in their official capacity, outside their official capacity *or in a private capacity*" [emphasis added].(6) In addition, Article 8 of the Covenant prohibits slavery and Article 9 guarantees the right to liberty and security of person. Article 6 of the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination against Women, also ratified by Israel in 1991, states: "States Parties shall take all appropriate measures, including legislation, to suppress all forms of traffic in women and exploitation of prostitution".

ISRAELI GOVERNMENTAL INSTITUTIONS AND TRAFFICKED WOMEN FROM FSU COUNTRIES

The Israeli government has failed to take adequate measures to prevent, investigate, prosecute and punish human rights abuses committed against trafficked women. In general, trafficked women are effectively treated as criminals by the various Israeli agencies with whom they come in contact, rather than as victims of human rights abuses. This is so even though many of them have been subjected to human rights abuses such as enslavement or torture, including rape and other forms of sexual abuse, by traffickers, pimps or others involved in Israel's sex industry. Trafficked women come into contact with many different Israeli governmental agencies, but there appears to be no coherent governmental policy to combat these human rights abuses. In meetings with Amnesty International's delegates, government officials expressed concern about the plight of trafficked women. But, except in the case of the Department of Criminal Legislation in the Ministry of Justice, most agencies had not apparently developed policies to combat these abuses (see section on criminal legislation below).

The Human Rights Committee commented on the treatment of trafficked women in its examination of Israel's initial report on implementation of the ICCPR.(7) The committee stated that it:

"regrets that women brought to Israel for the purposes of prostitution, many of whom are brought as a result of false pretences or coercion, are not protected as victims of trafficking but are likely to bear the penalties of their illegal presence in Israel by deportation. Such an approach to this problem effectively prevents these women from pursuing a remedy for the violation of their rights under article 8 of the Covenant. The Committee recommends that serious efforts be made to seek out and punish the traffickers, to institute rehabilitation programmes for the victims and to ensure that they are able to pursue legal remedies against the perpetrators".

Relevant criminal legislation

Under Israeli law, it is not illegal to engage in "prostitution" but the law criminalizes many activities associated with "prostitution", such as "procurement" (living off the earnings of a prostitute) or maintenance of a place for the purposes of prostitution. Trafficking of women to

Israel is not illegal. Section 202(b) of the Penal Code makes it a criminal offence to instigate a woman voluntarily or involuntarily *to leave Israel* with the intent that she should "practise prostitution abroad". The Ministry of Justice informed Amnesty International's delegates in 1999 that it had drafted an amendment to the Penal Code to replace section 202(b) with a broader criminal offence making it illegal for a person to instigate another person to leave the state in which they reside in order to engage in prostitution outside the state in which they resided. At the time of writing, this amendment had not apparently become law.

Many of the human rights abuses perpetrated by traffickers, pimps or others involved in Israel's sex industry, such as assault, rape, abduction and false imprisonment, are criminal offences. Article 10 of the Penal Code deals with offences relating to prostitution and obscenity. For example, section 201 makes it a criminal offence punishable by up to five years' imprisonment for a person to use force, coercion, narcotics, intoxicants, threats or deceit to procure a woman for an act of prostitution or to detain a woman against her will in order to procure her for an act of prostitution. The Ministry of Justice has drafted amendments to the Penal Code imposing higher penalties of seven years' imprisonment when a person is led into prostitution in aggravating circumstances, for example when the offence is committed through the use of force or employing other means of pressure or by threatening the above.

Slavery and the buying and selling of persons are not criminal offences. The Ministry of Justice is reportedly in the process of drafting a provision to criminalize the buying and selling of persons.

In March 2000 the Knesset (Israel's Parliament) passed the Equality of Women Law, section 6(b) of which states that every woman is entitled to protection from violence, sexual harassment, sexual exploitation and trafficking in her person. A commentary attached to the law indicates that protection should be provided by the state.

Laws relating to arrest, detention and deportation

Israeli law currently gives the Minister of the Interior broad powers to deport illegal aliens and to hold them in detention pending deportation. The Minister of the Interior may issue a deportation order against any person who is in Israel without a residence permit. The deportee is entitled to appeal to the Minister of the Interior within three days of issuance of the order and can also challenge the order in the High Court of Justice. Following the issuance of a deportation order, a deportee can be held in detention. Deportees can apply for bail to a committee within the Ministry of the Interior. The Israeli courts do not have jurisdiction to grant bail.

In response to a High Court challenge by ACRI, an Israeli non-governmental organization, the Israeli government announced in September 1999 that it would draft new legislation on deportation of illegal aliens, including provisions regulating arrest and detention and providing for judicial review. Legislation has been drafted but has not yet been submitted to the Knesset.

Arrest and deportation in practice

Many trafficked women end up in detention as a result of raids on brothels and massage parlours by the Israel Police. Normally the trafficked women will be arrested and served with a deportation order issued by the Minister of the Interior on the basis that they do not have a

valid visa to be in Israel. Trafficked women, like other deportees, are entitled to appeal to the Minister of the Interior against this deportation order or their detention or to challenge such a decision in the High Court. According to the Association for Civil Rights in Israel, appeals by deportees are rare. There is no legal aid available to deportees, even though they may be without financial resources to challenge these orders. As ACRI states: "This situation also creates the possibility of the indefinite detention of persons against whom a deportation order has been issued without judicial review of the deportation order or the arrest, in the absence of a complaint initiated by the detainee." (8) A deportee is required to take the initiative in challenging the order even though he or she may be unable to communicate because of language barriers, lack basic information about the procedures involved or lack the financial resources to afford legal representation.

According to the Israeli government, deportees should be detained only as a last resort after the Minister of the Interior has considered "less restrictive alternatives, such as house arrest, posting of bond, regular reporting to the police, and so on." (9) In fact decisions to detain trafficked women do not appear to be examined by the Minister of the Interior on a case by case basis nor does consideration appear to be given to these alternatives. Detention is the norm. Amnesty International is aware of a number of isolated cases where trafficked women have been released on bail to women's shelters designed for Israeli women subjected to domestic violence, normally when they have been willing to cooperate with the police.

Some women spend very short periods of time in detention. Others may be detained for months. Recently, the period of time which trafficked women spend in detention has considerably lessened, mainly as a result of lobbying by local Israeli non-governmental organizations. Now most trafficked women detained at Neve Tirza Prison are deported within two weeks. But there remain cases where women may be held for several months in detention because the Ministry of Justice has issued an order preventing the woman from leaving the country until she has testified in a criminal case.

The period of detention depends on a variety of factors. A woman cannot be deported until she has a valid travel document and a ticket. Many women do not have valid travel documents when they are arrested as these have been confiscated by the traffickers or the pimps; in other cases the travel documents are false. In such cases the women have to wait until their consulates issue them with new travel documents. There may sometimes be delays in issuing new travel documents, especially if a trafficked woman does not initially disclose her real identity. Normally the Ministry of the Interior requires deportees to pay for the travel costs of returning to their country of origin. If they are unable to pay, then the Ministry of the Interior pays the expenses. In the past, there were long delays in deportation because the Ministry of the Interior claimed it lacked financial resources, but the situation has apparently changed recently.

In violation of Article 10(2)(a) of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights trafficked women simply awaiting deportation have been detained with convicted criminals in Neve Tirza Prison, Israel's only women's prison. Alternatively, trafficked women have also been detained with remand detainees in the same prison or in police lock-ups pending deportation. Periods of detention in police lock-ups with criminal detainees can last weeks and detention conditions are reportedly very poor. Amnesty International's delegates met prison officials at Neve Tirza Prison during their mission. The officials informed them that about 900 female deportees had been held at the prison during the previous five years. Between 60 and 70 per cent, almost all of them from FSU countries, had been involved in the

sex industry, including between 10 and 20 girls aged less than 18. At the time of the visit, 17 women from FSU countries who had been involved in the sex industry were in detention at Neve Tirza.

Recently Neve Tirza Prison began to hold trafficked women in separate cells from criminal prisoners. There is no designated centre in Israel to house women awaiting deportation. A draft law prepared by the Ministry of Justice would require the Israeli government to establish, within two years of the law coming into force, special hostels for detaining illegal aliens.

Many trafficked women held in detention have been subjected to considerable physical and psychological trauma. However, no specially adapted services, for example counselling, designed to meet the specific needs of trafficked women from FSU countries, or indeed elsewhere, are available to these women. Prison officials at Neve Tirza Prison maintained that trafficked women had access to medical services to meet their physical and psychological needs. But the services available in Neve Tirza Prison are designed for sentenced prisoners who are Israeli nationals, and therefore are inappropriate to address the needs of trafficked women, let alone those of the ones among them who have been subjected to human rights abuses.

Law enforcement

Officials in the Israel Police and the Office of the State Attorney acknowledged to Amnesty International that it is difficult to conduct investigations and bring prosecutions against individuals who commit human rights abuses against trafficked women. The organization was in fact unable to obtain from the Israeli authorities statistics relating to the number of criminal investigations opened, or data on prosecutions or convictions in cases involving human rights abuses against trafficked women. However, Amnesty International was able to obtain official statistics for women claiming to be citizens of the Russian Federation deported from Israel in connection with their work as prostitutes. In 1998 132 women were deported. These figures represent an increase of nearly 100 per cent over the previous year.

Representatives of the Israel Police informed Amnesty International that in 1997, about 550 police files were opened under Article 10 of the Penal Code 1977, which covers prostitution and obscenity offences, and about 650 were opened in 1998. However, it was not clear how many of these files related to trafficked women. The Israel Police also informed Amnesty International that other investigations against traffickers and pimps were opened under other sections of the Penal Code, for crimes such as assault, kidnapping and unlawful possession of passports, but it was unable to provide Amnesty International with any statistics.

Various laws and policies in Israel, in particular the strict enforcement of immigration laws against trafficked women, discourage prosecutions of the people who assault, rape, unlawfully detain and/or otherwise abuse the human rights of these women. Many women are afraid to file complaints with the Israel Police or testify in criminal cases because they fear they will be imprisoned and deported, sometimes incurring severe economic loss. Women are also at risk of being subjected to further human rights abuses at the hands of their traffickers and pimps either in Israel or abroad. In 1998 the Israel Police announced that it would not arrest illegal aliens who filed complaints with the police unless there was another reason to arrest them beyond their mere illegal presence in the country.

Trafficked women are frequently unwilling to testify before the Israeli courts against individuals who have abused their human rights. A prosecutor interviewed by Amnesty International highlighted the gravity of the problem, explaining that in about 90 per cent of cases he had prosecuted involving trafficked women, the women had refused to testify in court even though they had previously provided statements to the Israel Police or to the State Attorney's Office. They are normally declared "hostile witnesses" thus allowing their previous statements to be considered as admissible evidence in court. Various factors discourage trafficked women from testifying. If a woman is ordered to testify, she runs the risk of being held in detention pending deportation, in most cases for a longer period than if she was not testifying. The Office of the State Attorney has the option to use the pre-trial testimony procedure, which would enable a trafficked woman to testify in court before the opening of a trial and to be deported quickly. Officials in the Office of the State Attorney expressed mixed feelings to Amnesty International about this procedure as it is often easier for defence lawyers to challenge pre-trial testimony than testimony given during the trial. Nevertheless, in some cases the State Attorney's Office has used this option.

Trafficked women may also be discouraged from testifying by fears for their own safety and that of their families. Officials in the Office of the State Attorney admitted to Amnesty International that they could not offer protection to trafficked women who feared intimidation in Israel or abroad if they testified in prosecutions. There is no witness protection system in Israel.

Anna, whose story is featured above, described to Amnesty International how she was brought to court to testify against her pimp.

"Now I know why we were kept in Kishon [Detention Centre] for such a long time: the prosecution wanted us to testify at [X]'s trial. But nobody told us this at the time. Nobody asked us whether we wanted to testify against him or not. We did not know that we would be witnesses. We never agreed to it. .. We were taken to the court room in handcuffs. They only told us in the court room: 'Now you are witnesses. You have to tell only the truth. We have immediately enrolled you as witnesses for the police. We don't really have to ask your permission for this'. We did not say anything in court."

"After that we were interrogated in the police department in Haifa. They asked us: 'Why didn't you say anything in court?' We said: 'Because nobody asked our consent to being witnesses.' ... [X] knows my address in St Petersburg and my telephone number because he kept my passport. I have a small daughter, eight years old, there. He threatened me that he would find me in Russia at home, if I did not behave as he wanted me to."

Forcible return

An official in the Ministry of the Interior told Amnesty International that there is no attempt by the ministry prior to deportation to determine whether a trafficked woman will be at risk of human rights abuses upon return to her country of origin. The same applies even when trafficked women have given information to the Israel Police or testified in criminal proceedings.

Such an approach places Israel in violation of the customary principle of *non-refoulement*. This principle, enshrined in the 1951 Convention relating to the Status of Refugees and in other instruments such as the Convention against Torture and Other Cruel, Inhuman or

Degrading Treatment or Punishment, the UN Principles on the Effective Prevention and Investigation of Extra-legal, Arbitrary and Summary Executions and the UN Declaration on the Protection of all Persons from Enforced Disappearance, prohibits the expulsion of anyone to a state where there are substantial grounds for believing that he or she would be in danger of being subjected to serious human rights abuses, including torture and extra-legal, arbitrary or summary execution. Generally, there is a duty on the sending state to take into account the human rights situation in the state of return and the risks that the individual concerned might face in this context before deciding to expel anyone.

This implies that there are certain obligations on the part of the government of Israel to allow for these women to have a determination of any rights they may have to international protection as provided for in the 1951 UN Refugee Convention. According to guiding principles of refugee law, those who wish to apply for asylum should be given the necessary facilities for submitting their cases to the authorities concerned and be given the opportunity to contact a representative of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees (UNHCR).

Some of those women who are to be deported might be able to sustain a claim as a Convention refugee according to the 1951 UN Refugee Convention definition. Essentially, they might have a claim to a well-founded fear of persecution because of a lack of state protection if there is evidence that they will be subject upon their return to human rights abuses for which the state is either unwilling or unable to protect them. Evidence of violence against trafficked women returned to their country of origin that would include a failure of the police to intervene to protect them or evidence that violence against trafficked women is not addressed as a serious public policy issue could support a finding that these women are refugees deserving of international protection.

In addition to any rights that might be available under the UN Refugee Convention, there is a general obligation on governments not to forcibly return a person to a situation where they may be at risk of torture or cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment according to *non-refoulement* provisions under the Convention against Torture. In effect, a woman who can sustain an argument that she is at risk of serious human rights abuses if returned to her country of origin should have a reasonable expectation of protection either under the UN Refugee Convention, the Convention against Torture, or at a minimum some form of protection under humanitarian programs. In addition, there is the concern that those women who provide testimony in criminal proceedings might by their very participation as witnesses place themselves in greater danger if returned to their country of origin. It would seem reasonable to argue that this may either result in them raising a claim as a refugee *sur place* or being deserving of consideration under humanitarian-based programs to acquire a right to remain in Israel under immigration criteria. In the event that the host state does not allow for immigration or does not have in place asylum adjudication processes then those women at risk should be able to access the resettlement programs of the UNHCR (as one of the three main solutions to international protection of refugees).

AMNESTY INTERNATIONAL'S RECOMMENDATIONS

Under international law the Israeli government is under an obligation to exercise due diligence in preventing, investigating, prosecuting and punishing human rights abuses committed against trafficked women. The Israeli government has taken some steps to combat these human rights abuses, particularly in the field of legislation, but these measures have not

been adequate. In the light of its obligation under international law, Amnesty International recommends the following:

- the Israeli government should conduct a review of how governmental agencies, in particular the Ministry of the Interior, the Israel Prisons Service, the Israel Police and the Office of the State Attorney, have responded to human rights abuses perpetrated against trafficked women in Israel;
- based on the outcome of this review, the Israeli authorities should develop an overall inter-agency strategy to ensure that there is a coordinated and effective response by the various agencies involved to the human rights abuses to which trafficked women are subjected.

In particular the Israeli government should:

- enact legislation making slavery and the buying and selling of persons unlawful;
- ensure that its criminal laws and criminal justice system treat trafficked women who have been victims of human rights abuses as such and as potential witnesses, rather than as criminals;
- with a view to enhancing Israel's overall capacity to investigate and prosecute human rights abuses in the context of trafficking, consideration should be given to the establishment of a specialized unit charged specifically with dealing with investigation and prosecution of these abuses;
- bring to justice, in accordance with internationally recognized fair trial standards, those alleged to have committed human rights abuses ranging from enslavement and other restrictions of liberty, to torture, including rape and other sexual assaults, against trafficked women;
- develop awareness-raising and training programs aimed at relevant government officials, in particular officials in the Ministry of the Interior, the Israel Police, the Israel Prisons Service and the Office of the State Attorney. These programs should be premised on an approach that takes into account human rights as well as law enforcement issues and should include information about the human rights abuses suffered by trafficked women, thereby emphasizing that they should be treated as victims of human rights abuses rather than as criminals;
- take steps to ensure the safety of victims of these human rights abuses, including of women who provide information to the police or who testify in criminal prosecutions, in Israel and abroad;
- increase international cooperation, in particular cooperation with the governments of the FSU and transit states to combat human rights abuses committed against trafficked women. The involvement of Embassies and Consulates of FSU countries in Israel should form a particular focus of attention for international cooperation in order to raise awareness about the plight and needs of trafficked women victims of human rights abuses. A forum of Israeli and Embassy and Consulate officials of FSU countries should be convened to identify areas of cooperation between recipient and sending countries;
- detain trafficked women pending deportation only as a last resort;
- ensure that trafficked women are held in detention in conditions which comply with the Body of Principles for the Protection of Persons under any Form of Detention or Imprisonment;

- open as soon as possible a hostel where trafficked women may stay pending deportation;
- ensure that trafficked women have access to appropriate services, including legal aid, counselling and medical services;
- in accordance with guiding principles of refugee law, give to trafficked women who wish to apply for asylum the necessary facilities for submitting their cases to the authorities concerned and the opportunity to contact a representative of the United Nations High Commissioner for Refugees.

(1) The term women shall be taken in this report to include girls as well.

(2) According to the Report of the Special Rapporteur on violence against women, submitted to the 56th session of the UN Commission on Human Rights: "The United States State Department recently claimed that 50,000 women are reportedly trafficked into the United States each year. The International Organization for Migration has been cited as estimating that 500,000 women are trafficked into Western Europe alone. The United Nations has estimated that 4 million persons are trafficked each year. Such figures are unreliable, however. Because of the underground nature of trafficking, reliable statistics are difficult, if not impossible, to collect. Further, the lack of a clear definition of trafficking poses a further limitation in the compilation of figures or statistics. Often, both governmental and non-governmental sources treat undocumented immigrants as one category irrespective of whether such immigrants were smuggled or trafficked." E/CN.4/2000/68, para. 72

(3) Sources: Sietske Altink, "Stolen Lives - trading women into sex and slavery", Scarlet Press, London, 1995 and "Trafficking and Prostitution: The Growing Exploitation of Migrant Women from Central and Eastern Europe", International Organization for Migration, 1995, at http://www.iom.int/IOM/Publications/books_studies_surveys/MIP_traff_women_eng.htm, Chapter Two.

(4) *Yediot Aharonot*, 23 May 1999.

(5) The Human Rights Committee is a body of independent experts established pursuant to Article 28 of the ICCPR to monitor compliance with and implementation of the provisions of the Covenant by States Parties.

(6) General Comment 20, Article 7 (Forty-fourth session, 1992).

(7) CCPR/C/79/Add.93 Concluding Observations/Comments, adopted on 28 July 1998, para. 16.

(8) Association for Civil Rights In Israel, "Comments on the Combined Initial and First Periodic Reports Concerning the Implementation of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights", July 1998, page 72.

(9) CCPR/C/81/Add.13 9 April 1998, Combined Initial and First Periodic Report concerning Implementation of the International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights, para. 396.

Plundering Ukraine's Women

- @ Specter New York Times 11-Jan-1998 Slave trade in Slavic women
 @ Staff Jerusalem Post 13-Jan-1998 There is no law against slavery in Israel
 @ Lily Hyde The Kyiv Post 23-Jan-1998 Woman who defied her pimps was beheaded
 @ Prytulak Comment on ABC 18-Mar-1998 Impossibilities of a TV documentary
 @ Prytulak Hypotheses 07-Apr-1998 Alphonse pogrom: Unique or universal?
 @ Blomquist New York Post 08-Jan-2000 Hillary Clinton Soft on Trafficking in Women?
 @ Bennett/Colson Wall Street Journal 10-Jan-2000 Clintons shrug at sex trafficking
 @ Bell National Post 18-May-2000 Israel still enslaves Slavic women
 @ Goldenberg The Guardian 16-Aug-2000 The dead women came from Ukraine
-

Slave trade in Slavic women

Traffickers' New Cargo: Naive Slavic women

CONTRABAND WOMEN

A special report

The New York Times
Sunday, January 11, 1998

By MICHAEL SPECTER

RAMLE, Israel — Irina always assumed that her beauty would somehow rescue her from the poverty and hopelessness of village life. A few months ago, after answering a vague ad in a small Ukrainian newspaper, she slipped off a tour boat when it put in at Haifa, hoping to make a bundle dancing naked on the tops of tables.

She was 21, self-assured and glad to be out of Ukraine. Israel offered a new world, and for a week or two everything seemed possible. Then, one morning, she was driven to a brothel, where her boss burned her passport before her eyes.

"I own you," she recalled his saying. "You are my property, and you will work until you earn your way out. Don't try to leave. You have no papers and you don't speak Hebrew. You will be arrested and deported. Then we will get you and bring you back."

It happens every single day. Not just in Israel, which has deported nearly 1,500 Russian and Ukrainian women like Irina in the past three years. But throughout the world, where selling naive and desperate young women into sexual bondage has become one of the fastest-growing criminal enterprises in the robust global economy.

The international bazaar for women is hardly new, of course. Asians have been its basic commodity for decades. But economic hopelessness in the Slavic world has opened what experts call the most lucrative market of all to criminal gangs that have flourished since the fall of Communism: Eastern European women with little to sustain them but their dreams. Pimps, law-enforcement officials and relief groups all agree that Ukrainian and Russian women are now the most valuable in the trade.

Because their immigration is often illegal — and because some percentage of the women choose to work as prostitutes — statistics are difficult to assess. But the United Nations estimates that 4 million people throughout the world are trafficked each year — forced through lies and coercion to work against their will in many types of servitude. The International Organization for Migration has said that as many as 500,000 women are annually trafficked into Western Europe alone.

Many end up like Irina. Stunned and outraged by the sudden order to prostitute herself, she simply refused. She was beaten and raped before she succumbed. Finally she got a break. The brothel was raided, and she was brought here to Neve Tirtza in Ramle, the only women's prison in Israel. Now, like hundreds of Ukrainian and Russian women with no documents or obvious forgeries, she is waiting to be sent home.

"I don't think the man who ruined my life will even be fined," she said softly, slow tears filling her enormous green eyes. "You can call me a fool for coming here. That's my crime. I am stupid. A stupid girl from a little village. But can people really buy and sell women and get away with it? Sometimes I sit here and ask myself if that really happened to me, if it can really happen at all."

Then, waving her arm toward the muddy prison yard, where Russian is spoken more commonly than Hebrew, she whispered one last thought: "I'm not the only one, you know. They have ruined us all."

Traffic Patterns: Russia and Ukraine Supply the Flesh

Centered in Moscow and the Ukrainian capital, Kiev, the networks trafficking women run east to Japan and Thailand, where thousands of young Slavic women now work against their will as prostitutes, and west to the Adriatic Coast and beyond. The routes are controlled by Russian crime gangs based in Moscow. Even when they do not specifically move the women overseas, they provide security, logistical support, liaison with brothel owners in many countries and, usually, false documents.

Women often start their hellish journey by choice. Seeking a better life, they are lured by local advertisements for good jobs in foreign countries at wages they could never imagine at home.

In Ukraine alone, the number of women who leave is staggering. As many as 400,000 women under 30 have gone in the past decade, according to their country's interior ministry. The Thai Embassy in Moscow, which

processes visa applications from Russia and Ukraine, says it receives nearly 1,000 visa applications a day, most of these from women.

Israel is a fairly typical destination. Prostitution is not illegal here, although brothels are, and with 250,000 foreign male workers — most of whom are single or here without their wives — the demand is great. Police officials estimate that there are 25,000 paid sexual transactions every day. Brothels are ubiquitous.

None of the women seem to realize the risks they run until it is too late. Once they cross the border their passports will be confiscated, their freedoms curtailed and what little money they have taken from them at once.

"You want to tell these kids that if something seems too good to be true it usually is," said Lyudmilla Biryuk, a Ukrainian psychologist who has counseled women who have escaped or been released from bondage. "But you can't imagine what fear and real ignorance can do to a person."

The women are smuggled by car, bus, boat and plane. Handed off in the dead of night, many are told they will pick oranges, work as dancers or as waitresses. Others have decided to try their luck at prostitution, usually for what they assume will be a few lucrative months. They have no idea of the violence that awaits them.

The efficient, economically brutal routine — whether here in Israel, or in one of a dozen other countries — rarely varies. Women are held in apartments, bars and makeshift brothels; there they service, by their own count, as many as 15 clients a day. Often they sleep in shifts, four to a bed. The best that most hope for is to be deported after the police finally catch up with their captors.

Few ever testify. Those who do risk death. Last year in Istanbul, Turkey, according to Ukrainian police investigators, two women were thrown to their deaths from a balcony while six of their Russian friends watched.

In Serbia, also last year, said a young Ukrainian woman who escaped in October, a woman who refused to work as a prostitute was beheaded in public.

In Milan, Italy, a week before Christmas, the police broke up a ring that was holding auctions in which women abducted from the countries of the former Soviet Union were put on blocks, partially naked, and sold at an average price of just under \$1,000.

"This is happening wherever you look now," said Michael Platzer, the Vienna, Austria-based head of operations for the U.N.'s Center for International Crime Prevention. "The Mafia is not stupid. There is less law enforcement since the Soviet Union fell apart and more freedom of movement. The earnings are incredible. The overhead is low — you don't have to buy cars and guns. Drugs you sell once and they are gone. Women can earn money for a long time."

"Also," he added, "the laws help the gangsters. Prostitution is semilegal in many places and that makes enforcement tricky. In most cases punishment is very light."

In some countries, Israel among them, there is not even a specific law against the sale of human beings.

Platzer said that although certainly "tens of thousands" of women were sold into prostitution each year, he was uncomfortable with statistics since nobody involved has any reason to tell the truth.

"But if you want to use numbers," he said, "think about this. Two hundred million people are victims of contemporary forms of slavery. Most aren't prostitutes, of course, but children in sweatshops, domestic workers, migrants. During four centuries, 12 million people were believed to be involved in the slave trade between Africa and the New World. The 200 million — and many of course are women who are trafficked for sex — is a current figure. It's happening now. Today."

Distress Calls: Far-Flung Victims Provide Few Clues

The distress call came from Donetsk, the bleak center of coal production in southern Ukraine. A woman was screaming on the telephone line. Her sister and a friend were prisoners in a bar somewhere near Rome. They spoke no Italian and had no way out, but had managed, briefly, to get hold of a man's cell phone.

"Do you have any idea where they are, exactly?" asked Olga Shved, who runs La Strada in Kiev, Ukraine's new center dedicated to fighting the trafficking of women in Eastern Europe and the countries of the former Soviet Union.

The woman's answer was no. Ms. Shved began searching for files and telephone numbers of the local consul, the police, anybody who could help.

"Do they know how far from Rome they are?" she asked, her voice tightening with each word. "What about the name of the street or the bar? Anything will help," she said, jotting notes furiously as she spoke. "We can get the police on this, but we need something. If they call back, tell them to give us a clue. The street number. The number of a bus that runs past. One thing is all we need."

Ms. Shved hung up and called officials at Ukraine's Interior Ministry and the Foreign Ministry. Her conversations were short, direct and obviously a routine part of her job.

That is because Ukraine — and to a lesser degree its Slavic neighbors Russia and Belarus — has replaced Thailand and the Philippines as the epicenter of the global business in trafficking women. The Ukrainian problem has been worsened by a ravaged economy, an atrophied system of law enforcement, and criminal gangs that grow more brazen each year. Young European women are in demand, and Ukraine, a country of 51 million people, has a seemingly endless supply. It is not that hard to see why.

Neither Russia nor Ukraine reports accurate unemployment statistics. But even partial numbers present a clear story of chaos and economic dislocation.

Federal employment statistics in Ukraine indicate that more than two-thirds of the unemployed are women. The government also keeps another statistic: employed but not working. Those are people who technically have jobs, and can use company amenities like day-care centers and hospitals. But they do not work or get paid. Three-quarters are women. And of those who have lost their jobs since the Soviet Union dissolved in 1991, more than 80 percent are women.

The average salary in Ukraine today is slightly less than \$30 a month, but it is half that in the small towns that criminal gangs favor for recruiting women to work abroad. On average, there are 30 applicants for every job in most Ukrainian cities. There is no real hope; but there is freedom.

In that climate, looking for work in foreign countries has increasingly become a matter of survival.

"It's no secret that the highest prices now go for the white women," said Marco Buffo, executive director of On the Road, an antitrafficking organization in northern Italy. "They are the novelty item now. It used to be Nigerians and Asians at the top of the market. Now it's the Ukrainians."

Economics is not the only factor causing women to flee their homelands. There is also social reality. For the first time, young women in Ukraine and Russia have the right, the ability and the willpower to walk away from their parents and their hometowns. Village life is disintegrating throughout much of the former Soviet world, and youngsters are grabbing any chance they can find to save themselves.

"After the wall fell down, the Ukrainian people tried to live in the new circumstances," said Ms. Shved. "It was very hard, and it gets no easier. Girls now have few opportunities yet great freedom. They see 'Pretty Woman,' or a thousand movies and ads with the same point, that somebody who is rich can save them. The glory and ease

of wealth is almost the basic point of the Western advertising that we see. Here the towns are dying. What jobs there are go to men. So they leave."

First, however, they answer ads from employment agencies promising to find them work in a foreign country. Here again, Russian crime gangs play a central role. They often recruit people through seemingly innocuous "mail order bride" meetings. Even when they do not, few such organizations can operate without paying off one gang or another. Sometimes want ads are almost honest, suggesting that the women can earn up to \$1,000 a month as "escorts" abroad. Often they are vague or blatantly untrue.

Recruiting Methods: Ads Make Offers Too Good To Be True

One typical ad used by traffickers in Kiev last year read: "Girls: Must be single and very pretty. Young and tall. We invite you for work as models, secretaries, dancers, choreographers, gymnasts. Housing is supplied. Foreign posts available. Must apply in person."

One young woman who did, and made it back alive, described a harrowing journey. "I met with these guys, and they asked if I would work at a strip bar," she said. "Why not, I thought. They said we would have to leave at once. We went by car to the Slovak Republic where they grabbed my passport. I think they got me new papers there, but threatened me if I spoke out. We made it to Vienna, then to Turkey. I was kept in a bar and I was told I owed \$5,000 for my travel. I worked for three days, and on the fourth I was arrested."

Lately, the ads have started to disappear from the main cities — where the realities of such offers are known now. These days the appeals are made in the provinces, where their success is undiminished.

Most of the thousands of Ukrainian women who go abroad each year are illegal immigrants who do not work in the sex business. Often they apply for a legal visa — to dance, or work in a bar — and then stay after it expires.

Many go to Turkey and Germany, where Russian crime groups are particularly powerful. Israeli leaders say that Russian women — they tend to refer to all women from the former Soviet Union as Russian — disappear off tour boats every day. Officials in Italy estimate that at least 30,000 Ukrainian women are employed illegally there now.

Most are domestic workers, but a growing number are prostitutes, some of them having been promised work as domestics only to find out their jobs were a lie. Part of the problem became clear in a two-year study recently concluded by the Washington-based nonprofit group Global Survival Network: Police officials in many countries just don't care.

The network, after undercover interviews with gangsters, pimps and corrupt officials, found that local police forces — often those best able to prevent trafficking — are least interested in helping.

Gillian Caldwell of Global Survival Network has been deeply involved in the study. "In Tokyo," she said, "a sympathetic senator arranged a meeting for us with senior police officials to discuss the growing prevalence of trafficking from Russia into Japan. The police insisted it wasn't a problem, and they didn't even want the concrete information we could have provided. That didn't surprise local relief agencies, who cited instances in which police had actually sold trafficked women back to the criminal networks which had enslaved them."

Official Reactions: Best-Placed To Help, but Least Inclined

Complacency among police agencies is not uncommon.

"Women's groups want to blow this all out of proportion," said Gennadi Lepenko, chief of Kiev's branch of Interpol, the international police agency. "Perhaps this was a problem a few years ago. But it's under control now."

That is not the view at Ukraine's parliament — which is trying to pass new laws to protect young women — or at the Interior Ministry.

"We have a very serious problem here, and we are simply not equipped to solve it by ourselves," said Mikhail Lebed, chief of criminal investigations for the Ukrainian Interior Ministry. "It is a human tragedy, but also, frankly, a national crisis. Gangsters make more from these women in a week than we have in our law-enforcement budget for the whole year. To be honest, unless we get some help we are not going to stop it."

But solutions will not be simple. Criminal gangs risk little by ferrying women out of the country; indeed, many of the women go voluntarily. Laws are vague, cooperation between countries rare and punishment of traffickers almost nonexistent. Without work or much hope of a future at home, an eager teen-ager will find it hard to believe that the promise of a job in Italy, Turkey or Israel is almost certain to be worthless.

"I answered an ad to be a waitress," said Tamara, 19, a Ukrainian prostitute in a massage parlor near Tel Aviv's old Central Bus Station, a Russian-language ghetto for the cheapest brothels. "I'm not sure I would go back now if I could. What would I do there, stand on a bread line or work in a factory for no wages?"

Tamara, like all other such women interviewed for this article, asked that her full name not be published. She has classic Slavic features, with long blond hair and deep green eyes. She turned several potential customers away so she could speak at length with a reporter. She was willing to talk as long as her boss was out. She said she was not watched closely while she remained within the garish confines of the "health club."

"I didn't plan to do this," she said, looking sourly at the rich red walls and leopard prints around her. "They took my passport, so I don't have much choice. But they do give me money. And believe me, it's better than anything I could ever get at home."

Yitzhak Tyler, the chief of undercover activities for the Haifa police, is a big, open-faced man who doesn't mince words.

"We got a hell of a problem on our hands," he said. The port city of 200,000 has become the easiest entryway for women brought to Israel to work as prostitutes — though by no means the only one. Sometimes they walk off tour boats, but increasingly they come with forged documents that enable them to live and work in Israel. These have often been bought or stolen from elderly Jewish women in Russia or Ukraine.

"This is a sophisticated, global operation," Tyler said. "It's evil, and it's successful because the money is so good. These men pay \$500 to \$1,000 for a Ukrainian or Russian woman. Do you understand what I am telling you? They will buy these women and make a fortune out of them."

To illustrate his point, Tyler grabbed a black calculator and started calling out the sums as he punched them in.

"Take a small place," he said, "with 10 girls. Each has 15 to 20 clients a day. Multiply that by say 200 shekels. So say 30,000 shekels a day comes in to each place. Each girl works 25 days a month. Minimum."

Tyler was busy doing math as he spoke. "So we are talking about 750,000 shekels a month, or about \$215,000. A man often owns five of these places. That's a million dollars. No taxes, no real overhead. It's a factory with slave labor. And we've got them all over Israel."

The Tropicana, in Tel Aviv's bustling business district, is one of the busiest bordellos. The women who work there, like nearly all prostitutes in Israel today, are Russian. Their boss, however, is not.

"Israelis love Russian girls," said Jacob Golan, who owns this and two other clubs, and spoke willingly about the business he finds so "successful." "They are blonde and good-looking and different from us," he said, chuckling as he drew his hand over his black hair. "And they are desperate. They are ready to do anything for money."

Always filled with half-naked Russian women, the club is open around the clock. There is a schedule on the wall next to the receptionist — with each woman's hours listed in a different color, and the days and shifts rotating, as at a restaurant or a bar. Next to the schedule a sign reads, "We don't accept checks." Next to that there is a poster for a missing Israeli woman.

There are 12 cubicles at the Tropicana where 20 women work in shifts, eight during the daytime, 12 at night. Business is always booming, and not just with foreign workers. Israeli soldiers, with rifles on their shoulders, frequent the place, as do business executives and tourists.

Mr. Golan was asked if most women who work at the club do so voluntarily. He laughed heartily.

"I don't get into that," he said, staring vacantly across his club at four Russian women sitting on a low couch. "They are brought here and told to work. I don't force them. I pay them. What goes on between them and the men they are with, how could that be my problem?"

Deterrent Strategies: A System that Fails Those Who Testify

Every once in a while, usually with great fanfare and plenty of advance notice, Golan gets raided. He pays a fine, and the women without good false documents are taken to prison.

If they are deported, the charges against them are dropped. But if a woman wants to file a complaint, then she must remain in prison until a trial is held. "In the past four years," Betty Lahan, prison director of Neve Tirtsa here, said, "I don't know of a single case where a woman chose to testify."

Such punitive treatment of victims is the rule rather than the exception. In Italy, where the police say killings of women forced into prostitution average one a month, parliament tried to create a sort of witness protection program. But it only allowed women to stay in the country for one year and did nothing to hide their identities.

"The deck is just so completely stacked against the women in all this," said Daniella Pompei, an immigration specialist with the community of Sant'Egidio, the Catholic relief agency in Rome. "The police is the last place these women want to go." She said that only 20 women had ever used the protection program.

It is not clear who will stop the mob. On a trip to Ukraine late last year, Hillary Rodham Clinton spoke out about the new slave trade that has developed so rapidly there. The United States and the European Union have plans to work together to educate young women about the dangers of working abroad. Other initiatives, like stays of deportation for prisoners, victims' shelters and counseling, have also been discussed.

"I don't care about any of that," said Lena, a young Latvian, one of the inmates waiting to be deported here. "I just want to know one thing. How will I ever walk down the street like a human being again?"

Staff Writer Jerusalem Post 13-Jan-1998 There is no law against slavery in Israel

Jerusalem Post
<http://www.jpost.co.il/Opinion/Article-0.html>
 Tuesday, January 13, 1998 15 Tevet 5758

EDITORIAL: A modern form of slavery

(January 13) - Prostitution is often euphemistically called the world's oldest profession, but it has become the newest business of choice for organized crime. Modern Western culture has at times even glorified prostitution and given the debate over it a tinge of civil rights versus religious morality. Such civics lesson-style dilemmas must be set aside in order to address the problem in its current incarnation, in which prostitution is often a modern form of slavery, pure and simple.

This Sunday's New York Times reports that the "selling [of] naive and desperate young women into sexual bondage has become one of the fastest-growing criminal enterprises in the robust global economy." Recently, this trade has shifted and expanded from Asia, where it has been going on for years, to the former Soviet Union, which experts call "the most lucrative market of all to criminal gangs that have flourished since the fall of Communism."

Israel, of course, is not the only country where this market is flourishing, but circumstances have conspired to make Israel a prime destination for traders in human beings. An extensive report soon to be released by the Women's Lobby - based on dozens of interviews with police, government officials, prostitutes, and local diplomats - paints a daunting picture of the scope of the problem. According to the report, a sophisticated network of gangs is taking advantage of Israeli immigration laws to import Ukrainian and Russian women, promising them work as waitresses or dancers, and instead forcing them into prostitution.

A woman called Irina, interviewed in Neveh Tirza Prison by The New York Times before being deported, had been lured to Israel by an advertisement in a small Ukrainian newspaper. She slipped off a tourist boat in Haifa, and planned on making a bundle doing nude dancing here. Upon arrival, her Israeli contact drove her to a brothel and burned her passport before her eyes, saying that she was now his property and would have to earn her way home through prostitution.

The country's 250,000 foreign workers, most of them men who are single or without their families, provide a ready-made clientele for the imported prostitutes. Each prostitute earns her "owners" \$50,000 to \$100,000 a year, resulting in a \$450 million industry in Israel alone. Of this, the women themselves receive almost nothing, and their only hope becomes a police raid that will lead to their deportation. In the meantime, smugglers play a cat and mouse game with police, disguising their victims as nuns, or circus performers, or any other ruse that will get them into the country.

The police, trying to stop the flow, have at times become overzealous, stopping one medical student from St. Petersburg on the way to visit her family and sending her back home. The Absorption Ministry ended up apologizing to her and inviting her back, after which she told reporters that the Israeli authorities evidently thought "every blond woman from Russia is a prostitute." Removing the terribly unfair stigma of prostitution that haunts Russian immigrants is, in fact, one of the many reasons why this scourge must be fought. The problem, however, has largely been met with complacency by the authorities. Since prostitution itself is not illegal, and both the victims and the users of the system tend to be foreigners, it has been easy not to attach too great a priority to addressing the problem. Prostitution rings, however, should not be considered purely a criminal menace, but a moral challenge to Israeli society: can we tolerate a burgeoning slave trade in our midst?

According to the Women's Lobby, part of the problem is that there is no law against slavery in Israel. Though a shortage of legal authority is probably not the major problem in combating the trading of women into prostitution, whatever legal holes that exist should be filled. In addition, the law and its enforcement should not be focused on the prostitutes themselves, who are after all usually the principal victims. Though deporting the victims does provide them a semblance of freedom and deprive the criminals of income, it is those who keep these women in bondage who deserve to be hunted, caught, and jailed.

Lily Hyde The Kyiv Post 23-Jan-1998 Another woman who defied her pimps was beheaded

Women's groups battle sex slavery

By Lily Hyde

POST STAFF WRITER

23-Jan-1998

They work in massage parlors, strip bars and sex clubs from Israel to the Orient. Lured away from the boredom and poverty of small towns in Ukraine and Russia by promises of employment and a chance to travel abroad, they are duped or abducted by pimps and gangsters, often while law enforcement officials look the other way.

They are smuggled abroad; their passports are stolen. They are beaten, raped and forced to work as prostitutes to pay back "travel expenses" incurred by their abductors and employers. They are terrified, easily cowed, and highly prized for their Slavic features by sex merchants and bordello owners. If they refuse to work or manage to escape, they are recaptured and punished, sometimes tortured and killed.

If it sounds like Thailand or the Philippines, it's no coincidence. Thanks to lax legislation, complacent enforcement agencies, rampant unemployment and a mafia given virtual free reign over half a hemisphere, Ukraine and Russia have become the new capitals of the booming global trade in sex slaves.

A Jan. 11 cover story in The New York Times painted a horrific picture of innocents abroad, young Ukrainian women leaving the country in droves seeking employment and ending up abroad virtual prisoners, working in brothels and sex clubs against their will and subject to physical abuse and in some cases murder at the hands of gangsters and employers.

Statistical estimates are difficult to obtain, as border crossings are often illegal, and women who return home alive are often too scared or embarrassed to give detailed information. Still the article cites statistics from Ukraine's Interior Ministry that give some idea of the scope of the problem: more than 400,000 women under the age of 30 have left Ukraine in the last decade.

Some of them are aware of the sexual nature of the jobs waiting for them when they begin their journeys. They respond to advertisements seeking topless dancers, waitresses in sex clubs, and even prostitutes, but are woefully naive about the true nature of the work they are expected to perform.

Other young women apply for jobs as au pairs or housemaids, or expect to meet a potential husband from a rich Western country. At border crossings their passports are confiscated, and they soon find themselves stranded in a country where they do not speak the language and few laws exist to help them.

The Times recounted the story of one young Ukrainian woman who answered a newspaper ad seeking topless dancers in Israel, a country with a thriving sex trade involving women from former Soviet countries. A week or so into her stay, she was driven to a brothel, where her new boss burned her passport before her eyes.

"I own you," she told The Times her boss said. "You are my property, and you will work until you earn your way out. Don't try to leave. You have no papers and you don't speak Hebrew. You will be arrested and deported. Then we will get you and bring you back."

That young woman was one of the relatively lucky ones. The club where she worked was raided by police and she was sent to a women's prison, where she awaits deportation back to Ukraine. Others who resist, try to contact rescue organizations or escape sometimes end up paying with their lives.

The Times report cited Ukrainian police investigators who said that last year in Istanbul, Turkey, two women were thrown from a building and killed while six friends looked on helplessly. Another woman who defied her pimps was beheaded in Serbia last year, The Times quoted an escaped Ukrainian woman as saying.

The stories are painful to hear. But law enforcement and rescue agencies in Ukraine and abroad are thankful that they are starting to be told. While they wait for legislation to protect women and hamper traffickers, their only real weapon is public awareness of the growing problem.

Draft laws are still on the drawing boards in Ukrainian. A bill to protect women from trafficking is slated for parliamentary debate in March, but a spokesman from the Ministry of Family and Youth Affairs said no specific information was available about what measures the bill provides for.

Ukraine's current criminal code provides for the prosecution of pimps and brothel owners, but in 1996 only 24 individuals were convicted, according to La Strada, an anti-trafficking organization funded by the European Union. Meanwhile, La Strada's hotline, which operates just one day a week for nine hours, receives up to 15 calls each day it is manned.

Ukrainian investigators say they are simply outnumbered and outmaneuvered by slick, well-financed trafficking rings. "We have a very serious problem here, and we are simply not equipped to solve it by ourselves," Mikhail Lebed, chief of criminal investigations for the Ministry of the Interior told *The Times*. "It is a human tragedy, but also, frankly, a national crisis. Gangsters make more from these women in a week than we have in our law-enforcement budget for the whole year. To be honest, unless we get some help we are not going to stop it."

In other countries, such as Israel, forms of prostitution are legal, which makes convicting traffickers extremely problematic. Trijntje Kootstra, the Holland-based director of La Strada in Eastern Europe, said that traffickers evade prosecution by claiming the women knew what they were getting into, and that prosecutors generally have a hard time establishing the line between voluntary and enforced prostitution.

"Women are really like goods for [traffickers]. It's more profitable for them to sell women because they hardly ever get caught," said Kootstra.

Other concerned aid workers called for harsher sentences for convicted pimps and traffickers. "Often sentencing is minor and doesn't prevent them from continuing in this line of business," said Natalka Kocan, coordinator for a new information and prevention program run in Ukraine by the International Organization for Migration. "Some sort of disincentive for these people is needed."

Convincing women who are rescued or return to testify is nearly impossible. Victims fear reprisal, and some are reluctant to talk because they were recruited by people they and their families knew personally.

The words of Angela, a Russian woman trafficked to Germany and interviewed by the Washington-based Global Survival Network as part of their 1997 report on trafficking, are typical.

"When I come back to Russia, [the mafia] will simply kill me. They know my family very well."

Dangers aside, many Ukrainian women are simply ashamed of what has happened to them and prefer to keep silent.

"It is taboo in Ukrainian society to talk about prostitution openly," said Oksana, a manager of La Strada in Ukraine who declined to give her last name.

La Strada's hotline provides counseling and emergency help in finding and rescuing captive women, but its plans to open shelters have so far come to nothing. No shelters exist for women in Ukraine, and there are only two crisis centers nationwide.

Complacency on the part of government and law enforcement officials is as much to blame as financial difficulties, according to Katerina, another La Strada coordinator. "It isn't only a problem of money," she said. "Our government bodies cannot understand that it is very, very important for women."

One high level enforcement officer said the problem had been exaggerated.

"Women's groups want to blow this all out of proportion," said Gennadi Lepenko, chief of the Kyiv branch of Interpol, in a *Times* interview. "Perhaps this was a problem a few years ago. But it's under control now."

Other aid for victims of trafficking is being channeled to Ukraine via the International Organization for Migration program, funded jointly by the European Union and the United States. Launched in September at the

request of the U.S. State Department, the first stage of the program consists of nationwide surveys and discussions researching women's ideas about work in the West. The second stage is an information campaign to begin in April.

The program is aimed at "giving women an informed choice," said coordinator Kocan.

She said the government ministries involved in the issue had been "receptive" to the program.

"There is now an interest ... at least we've come that far," she said. "Now new legislation and victim support is needed."

Lubomyr Prytulak ABC TV *Prime Time* 18-Mar-1998 Impossibilities of a TV documentary

Jacob Golan's vice empire is possible only because Slavic women are poor. Jacob Golan makes money only because the economies of Ukraine and Russia have collapsed. Jacob Golan will continue to make money featuring Slavic sex slaves only as long as these economies stay collapsed. Thus, Ukraine's weak economic performance is in the interests of Jacob Golan and his fellow criminals....

Unanswered Questions Concerning

Girls for Sale

A Comment on an
American Broadcasting Corporation Television Network
Prime Time documentary

by Lubomyr Prytulak

A most curious television documentary, *Girls for Sale*, was broadcast on 18 March 1998, over the ABC television network, by the investigative-journalism show, *Prime Time*. The host of the show was Diane Sawyer, producer Beth Osisek, editor Ed Delgado, and investigator Cynthia McFadden.

The focus of the story was the use of Former Soviet Union (FSU) girls in prostitution in Israel, where in fact 80% of the prostitutes are from the FSU. It appears that the majority of these girls were lured to Israel with false promises, are not paid, are treated brutally, raped, drugged, beaten, strangled, locked in a room without food or water, and are bought and sold by their owners, essentially slaves without rights and outside the protection of the law. Their situation is so dire that "prostitution" is a less appropriate description for it than is "white slavery," and the girls themselves are less accurately described as "prostitutes" than as "sex slaves."

What distinguishes the documentary in my mind is the questions that it implicitly raised but failed to answer.

Why Did Jacob Golan Grant the Interview?

The first question is why Jacob Golan gave the interview to *Prime Time*. Jacob Golan is the owner of the Tropicana brothel in Tel Aviv. Fortunately for Jacob Golan and unfortunately for his sex slaves, both prostitution

and slavery are legal in Israel; but unfortunately for Jacob Golan, the Slavic sex slaves are in Israel illegally, for which reason one might have expected that he would have learned over the course of building his criminal empire certain habits requisite for survival. One of these habits would be to avoid attracting attention, to not draw the spotlight onto himself, to avoid getting splashed onto the front pages. Another habit would be to plead poverty, to proclaim that his little family business (his son pimps as well) brought him next to nothing, barely covered expenses, in fact often fell short of meeting expenses so that it was for him a losing proposition. That is what we would expect Jacob Golan to plead because that helps keep away the police and the tax authorities, because it helps to dissuade other criminals from muscling in on his action, because it helps to portray the volume of sin as so small that it is unworthy of attention by anti-vice activists.

And yet that is not at all what Jacob Golan does. What he does do is to brag that his is one of the busiest and most profitable brothels in Israel. He estimates that he services 30,000 visitors yearly. On a good day, he reports grossing \$20,000. Jacob Golan does not at all seem to shy away from notoriety. He has no fear of the police. No fear of the taxman. No fear of other Israeli mobsters. No fear of having his brothel closed down. No fear of losing his lucrative income. In Israel, apparently, public confession by a prominent criminal places him in no appreciable jeopardy.

But Jacob Golan went even farther than that. Jacob Golan actually disclosed to the world that he is able to function only because he has a contact within the Interior Ministry whom he bribes at the rate of one thousand dollars per FSU sex slave for fake Israeli identification papers.

A Long String of Impossibilities

Jacob Golan not only draws attention to his own criminal empire, but brings discredit on the State of Israel, and guarantees the arrest of the bribe-taking contact within the Interior Ministry. Given this demonstration of Jacob Golan's inability to keep his own counsel, he guarantees that no other Interior Ministry official will ever take his bribes in the future. Having confessed his own criminal activities, Jacob Golan invites the raiding of his brothel, the deportation of his sex slaves, the closing down of his business, and his own imprisonment. If the *Prime Time* story is taken at face value, then Israeli police should have held correspondent Cynthia McFadden, and her crew, as witnesses, and ABC tapes of the Jacob Golan interview should have been confiscated and held as evidence. These are among the many things that one might expect if the *Prime Time* story was the investigative journalism documentary that it purports to be.

And yet none of these things happen. Even as part of this same documentary, Cynthia McFadden flaunts her information in the face of the Israeli government — she confronts an Interior Ministry official with "We interviewed a man who operates a very large brothel here in Israel, and he told us that he has a source inside the Ministry of the Interior — for which you work — who he can pay a thousand dollars and get false papers to bring girls in." The Interior Ministry official listens with an unperturbed perturbation, and says "This is just unbelievable!" without evincing surprise. Perhaps this scene had to be rehearsed a few times before he got it right, and by the final take he was getting bored. Carrying to perfection his duty of flak catcher, he shows the spontaneity of reading from a prompt card when he offers the following assurance: "I am certainly ready to check this information. And I promise that if this information is indeed accurate, we will do everything — and I mean *everything* — to check this and deal with this in order to stop it at its roots."

The American viewing public hears the flak catcher's promise, but having a short memory, neglects to wait for its fulfillment. We do not hear of Jacob Golan being stopped in his roots. The naive viewer — the viewer asking to be manipulated, begging to be gulled — at whom this program seems to be directed does not stop to ask whether an enterprise one of whose outlets grosses \$20,000 on a good day can possibly be unknown to Israeli authorities; whether a story that has travelled across the Atlantic to reach the ears of American television producers can be unknown to Israeli intelligence and to Israeli police; whether it is possible for a single individual within the Interior Ministry to issue false papers, or whether internal cross-checks would necessitate the cooperation of a number of such officials.

Our best bet is that nothing will happen to Jacob Golan as a result of his public confession. For having bribed a government official, we may venture to expect that he is today neither in jail, nor a fugitive from Israeli justice. His criminal enterprise has been disclosed to the Interior Ministry, but the cameras do not show us any ensuing raid on the Jacob Golan brothel, and do not show us Jacob Golan being led away in handcuffs. In his public confession Jacob Golan shows as much anxiety over the safety of his criminal enterprise as the Interior Ministry

Official shows sincerity in intending to bring it to a halt. No, when Jacob Golan looks to the future, it is to a bright, unperturbed, and expanding future. Just as his government boldly builds settlements to house the flood of Ukrainian and Russian scientists and engineers who come to help build the Israeli state, so Jacob Golan boldly expands his brothel to house the flood of Ukrainian and Russian sex slaves who come to satisfy Israeli lusts. Just as television news shows us Prime Minister Netanyahu proudly overseeing the construction of new settlements, so *Prime Time* shows us Jacob Golan proudly leading investigator Cynthia McFadden through the construction of expanding facilities: "Jacob Golan is doing so well, he is expanding his operation, which means soon he will be buying even more young women, he hopes from the Former Soviet Union."

Why Did the State of Israel Allow Jacob Golan to be Interviewed?

Israel must have known in advance of the visit of the *Prime Time* investigative journalism team, and must also have known what topic this team intended to cover, and who they intended to interview, and so was in a position to deny the team entry, or to interfere with its work, or at least to warn interviewees as to the dangers of being too candid. Also, the Israeli government could have monitored the taping of the Jacob Golan interview. Or, if the Israeli government found out the contents only after the taping had taken place, it could still have confiscated the tapes prior to their leaving Israel. Finally, even if uncensored tapes had been smuggled out of Israel, there would still be ample opportunity to suppress them during production or prior to broadcast. Why, in short, did Israel permit this story to be filmed?

The damage to Israeli prestige was substantial. Israel was portrayed as "One of the biggest markets per capita for women from the Eastern Block." The Israeli sex slave trafficking was portrayed not as the work of a few isolated individuals who had managed to elude Israeli justice, but rather as being large scale, as being conducted in a vile and reprehensible manner, as involving the complicity of the Israeli government, and as even being not entirely illegal, as Israel has no statutes prohibiting either prostitution or slavery. Nor did the documentary make any effort to deflect responsibility at the consumer end — that is, we are not told that the customers are foreign workers, forced to seek satisfaction in a brothel because they are far from homes and families. No, the only mention of Jacob Golan's customers is "His best customers may surprise you — Orthodox Jews!" This documentary is not going out of its way to help Israel save face.

Hypotheses

I offer the following hypotheses which might help explain the mysteries concerning *Prime Time's* documentary *Girls for Sale*. To many, these hypotheses will be unfamiliar, and for that reason alone will seem to be implausible. However, perhaps these unfamiliar hypotheses will seem less implausible than that Jacob Golan was gratuitously risking the loss of a business that grossed him \$20,000 on a good day. Perhaps these unfamiliar hypotheses will seem less implausible than that Israeli authorities had overlooked a vast criminal enterprise under their very noses which, however, came to the attention of American television producers across the Atlantic ocean. Perhaps these unfamiliar hypotheses will seem less implausible than that Israel has been unable to arrest Jacob Golan following his public confession because it failed to find any evidence of his wrongdoing.

The unfamiliar hypotheses which perhaps are not so implausible after all are: That Jacob Golan knew in advance that his public confession would not threaten his income and his personal safety. That Jacob Golan knew that his public confession was given under a blanket of immunity from prosecution. That Jacob Golan, in fact, was ordered to make this public confession. That this documentary, filmed in Israel, testified to by Israelis, broadcast over Jewish-influenced North American television, is in fact the only thing that it can be — an Israeli infommercial, commanded by the Israeli government.

Unless Jacob Golan was given a formal order by officials so senior that their authority could not be questioned, Jacob Golan's interview would have been suicidal, professionally and personally. Crime bosses do not ordinarily lay bare to the public the nature and the extent of their criminal activities. The circumstances of crime boss Jacob Golan's laying bare, therefore, must have been extraordinary, and must have included the extraordinary guarantee that his criminal activities would not be brought to a halt and that he would be immune from prosecution.

But how can such a situation arise? Two principles might help explain it: (1) Jewish ideology permits the exploitation of non-Jews, and (2) anti-Semitism promotes the immigration that Israel needs.

(1) Jewish Ideology Permits the Exploitation of non-Jews

The Israelis will not close Jacob Golan's brothel down in part because — despite what their legislation says — they cannot bring themselves to view its activity as terribly wrong. These are, after all, Slavic girls, and the men they are servicing are Jews. The Untermenschen give, the Übermenschen take. That is God's law. That is no more than one of the rewards for being a Jew that his religion promises him.

Whether Judaism does contain such laws is a question addressed by Israel Shahak in his book *Jewish History, Jewish Religion: The Weight of Three Thousand Years*, Pluto Press, London and Boulder Colorado, 1994, ISBN 0 7453 0818 X. The reader can find an outline of these laws — which Shahak describes as the *Jewish religious laws against Gentiles* — in [my letter of 27 September 1997](#) to rabbi Yaakov Dov Bleich of Kyiv. Of particular relevance is the question whether the Jewish religious laws against Gentiles discussed by Shahak had to be dug up out of medieval tomes buried in forgotten archives — and are no more than the sort of vicious and benighted beliefs that once characterized all religions — or whether these are laws that find some application even today and which find no parallel in at least contemporary Christianity. Shahak argues that the latter is the case, and provides several examples, of which the following is one:

I had personally witnessed an ultra-religious Jew refuse to allow his phone to be used on the Sabbath in order to call an ambulance for a non-Jew who happened to have collapsed in his Jerusalem neighbourhood. Instead of simply publishing the incident in the press, I asked for a meeting with the members of the Rabbinical Court of Jerusalem, which is composed of rabbis nominated by the State of Israel. I asked them whether such behaviour was consistent with their interpretation of the Jewish religion. They answered that the Jew in question had behaved correctly, indeed piously, and backed their statement by referring me to a passage in an authoritative compendium of Talmudic laws, written in this century. ... Neither the Israeli, nor the diaspora, rabbinical authorities ever reversed their ruling that a Jew should not violate the Sabbath in order to save the life of a Gentile. ... It became apparent to me ... that neither Zionism, including its seemingly secular part, nor Israeli politics since the inception of the State of Israel, nor particularly the policies of the Jewish supporters of Israel in the diaspora, could be understood unless the deeper influence of those laws, and the worldview which they both create and express is taken into account. (Shahak, 1994, pp. 1-2)

And that is why I — following Israel Shahak's lead — venture to suggest that one cannot understand the phenomenon of Israel's toleration of Jacob Golan — perhaps even Israel's protection of Jacob Golan — without an appreciation of the Jewish religious laws against Gentiles which permeate not only Jewish religious teaching, but also to some degree Israeli secular thinking as well. Below, I excerpt one of the many Israel Shahak quotations describing Jewish religious laws against Gentiles that I forwarded to rabbi Bleich for his comment in the above-mentioned letter. Although this quotation concerns sex laws, it does not address prostitution directly. Nor is the quotation offered as expressing laws that are followed in Israel today — such is obviously not the case. The relevance of this quotation, rather, lies in its demonstrating the superior rights which Jews have shown themselves capable of arrogating in the area of sexual behavior, and leads us to ask whether some weaker manifestation of this arrogation does not continue to this day:

Sexual intercourse between a married Jewish woman and any man other than her husband is a capital offence for both parties.... The status of Gentile women is very different. ... According to the *Talmudic Encyclopedia*: "... although a married Gentile woman is forbidden to the Gentiles, in any case a Jew is exempted."

This does not imply that sexual intercourse between a Jewish man and a Gentile woman is permitted — quite the contrary. But the main punishment is inflicted on the Gentile woman; she must be executed, even if she was raped by the Jew: "If a Jew has coitus with a Gentile woman, whether she be a child of three or an adult, whether married or unmarried, and even if he is a minor aged only nine years and one day — because he had wilful coitus with her, she

must be killed, as is the case with a beast, because through her a Jew got into trouble." The Jew, however, must be flogged.... (Shahak, 1994, p. 87)

(2) Anti-Semitism Promotes the Immigration that Israel Needs

The bad publicity, the stain on the name of Jews and of Israel, which result from the *Prime Time* broadcast *Girls for Sale* are small prices to pay for the benefit of inciting anti-Semitism among Slavs. Inciting anti-Semitism among Slavs is a benefit? Yes, from the point of view of Israel, it may be indeed. How so?

Because the flow of immigrants from the FSU to Israel is insufficient to meet Israeli targets, it needs prods to augment it. Anti-Semitism is one such prod. The image of the Jew as pimp, as brothel owner, as slave master, as ravager of Christian girls — is incendiary. And that is precisely the image that this documentary — filmed in Israel and broadcast over the Jewish-influenced North American media — painted. As a result, anti-Jewish antagonism within the Slavic world is bound to increase. As a further result, Jews within the FSU are bound to feel themselves less welcome in what they until recently regarded as their own home. And as the end result, more Jews will emigrate to Israel. The last great colonial outpost of the West, increasingly beset with threats to its survival, Israel tries to attain the critical population mass which will indisputably raise it from the insecure category of "colonial experiment which can be aborted if unsuccessful" to the secure category of "nation state which is here to stay."

With a vast amount of effort, Israel managed a one-time augmentation of its population over a number of years by some one million immigrants from the FSU. However, in Egypt alone, one million new babies are added to the population every eight months. Thus, Israel must labor unceasingly to increase its population in order to delay the day when it is swallowed up in a sea of Arabs. The day that the Israeli population stops growing, or even begins to shrink, is the day that Israel can begin the official countdown to its own demise.

The scientists and engineers which Israel acquires through immigration are enduring benefits. The damage to Israeli prestige of the *Prime Time* broadcast, in contrast, will be of short duration, and in any case brings no tangible loss. Jewish influence over the North American media guarantees that talk of Slavic sex slaves in Israeli brothels can be cut off as soon as desired. Soon, too, there must come a point at which no appreciable number of scientists or engineers remains in the Slavic world who are willing to come to Israel, and thus the benefit of Slavic anti-Semitism will be reduced, and at that time — if world opinion demands — Jacob Golan's brothel, and all the other Israeli brothels, can be shut down, or maybe just sized down, or at least asked to procure or abduct girls from some less complaining part of the world. Israel will then be able to step forward to take credit for having intervened in defense of the purity of Slavic womanhood. Israel will then be able to portray Golan's sex slave empire as an incongruous criminal operation within a largely non-criminal society, and not as a natural byproduct of Jewish ideology. The thousands — if not tens of thousands — of Slavic girls who have served as sex slaves in Jewish brothels or for Jewish pimps — well, every society has crime, every society has prostitution, so why should Israel be held to any higher standard?

An index of several articles on the sexual exploitation of Slavic women can be found by clicking on [PLUNDER WOMEN](#) either right in this sentence, or at the very bottom of the present page, or else at the very top.

PostScript: Is Ukraine's Weak Economic Performance in Anybody's Interests?

Jacob Golan's vice empire is possible only because Slavic women are poor. Jacob Golan makes money only because the economies of Ukraine and Russia have collapsed. Jacob Golan will continue to make money featuring Slavic sex slaves only as long as these economies stay collapsed. Thus, Ukraine's weak economic performance is in the interests of Jacob Golan and his fellow criminals, and all those whom he employs, and all those whom he bribes, and all those who directly and indirectly profit from his enterprise. For example, the Israeli electricians and carpenters and plumbers and painters who expand Jacob Golan's brothel profit, and so a

weak Ukrainian economy is in their interests. Ultimately, the Jewish customers who satisfy their lusts on the Ukrainian sex slaves have the weak Ukrainian economy to thank for supplying them with such choice victims.

Lubomyr Prytulak 07-Apr-1998 Alphonsenpogrom: Unique or universal?

The burden of blackmail, blacklegging, and criminal brutality explains the mob's fury. So too does the violence which the underworld did the Jewish name. For there is no doubt that in Warsaw the wildest stories about Jewish vice were in circulation. One set of slanderous letters in the press, for example, stated that "most brothel owners are Jews with university education. All customers are Jewish. The girls are mostly servants — Christian." — Edward J. Bristow

Alphonsenpogrom: Unique or universal?

by Lubomyr Prytulak

07-April-1998

In May 1905, Warsaw witnessed a pogrom that demolished forty houses, injured one hundred persons, and killed eight. This pogrom was called the *Alphonsenpogrom* for reasons that will be explained below. The *Alphonsenpogrom* is of particular interest because it initially gives the impression of being entirely different from other pogroms, but it nevertheless may merely make patent characteristics that lie hidden within all pogroms:

In Warsaw the Jewish involvement in prostitution so outraged the respectable portion of the community that in the revolutionary year of 1905, with all of the empire in political upheaval, Jewish workers there launched a murderous assault against their coreligionists' brothels, underworld dens, and cafes. This remarkable "*Alphonsenpogrom*" so named because local pimps were known as alphonses ... is an incident of the greatest value for the light it sheds on Jewish prostitution and its place in the life of the community.

There are many accounts of the Warsaw brothel riot. It was widely covered in the European press and it became part of Jewish folklore. ...

The exact origins are not important. In Warsaw and other cities throughout the Pale the Jewish working class had come to hate the underworld and any spark might have set off a conflagration. The underworld was powerful, well-organized, and supported by employers and the police. ...

... [E]vents soon got out of hand as the workers spontaneously seized the initiative. For three days they rampaged through brothels, looting and destroying furniture, knifing, beating, and defenestrating pimps and prostitutes. After visiting Krochmalna street, where Isaac Bashevis Singer spent part of his youth and saw the poor prostitutes whom he later depicted in his short stories, the rioters turned south to the fancier avenues off the city's major artery, the Marszalkowska. There was no single red-light district in the city and the

rioters' destruction was visited upon ten widely scattered streets.

... Reuter, the British news agency, reported forty houses of ill fame demolished, eight persons killed and one hundred injured. Among the casualties was one dead prostitute.

The burden of blackmail, blacklegging, and criminal brutality explains the mob's fury. So too does the violence which the underworld did the Jewish name. For there is no doubt that in Warsaw the wildest stories about Jewish vice were in circulation. One set of slanderous letters in the press, for example, stated that "most brothel owners are Jews with university education. All customers are Jewish. The girls are mostly servants — Christian." Reuter observed that "Jews became tired of hearing themselves called keepers of disorderly houses, thieves, usurers and other opprobrious epithets, and resolved, as the police were receiving bribes from these classes and protecting them, to take the matter into their own hands and resort to drastic measures."

There is an interesting footnote to the riot. Some of the dispossessed alphonenses fled Warsaw for the quieter confines of Lemberg [Lviv] across the border.

Edward J. Bristow, *Prostitution and Prejudice: The Jewish Fight Against White Slavery 1870-1939*, Shoken Books, New York, 1982, ISBN 0-8052-3866-2, pp. 58-61

Seven observations on the above *Alphonsepogrom*:

1. **Rational motives for some pogroms?** Though this pogrom was directed at Jews and at Jewish property, it was not motivated by irrational anti-Semitism, and calls to mind the question of whether rational motives could be discovered for other pogroms.
2. **Some pogroms are not Christians attacking Jews, but good attacking evil.** This pogrom was conducted by respectable Jews against criminal or destructive Jews because the latter were tarnishing the image of all Jews. This brings to mind the realization that events that may conventionally be depicted as Jewish-Slavic friction in fact may not divide participants cleanly along ethnic lines, but rather that the very elements within Jewish society that Slavs might object to might also be objected to by the majority of Jews. Perhaps, then, the friction is at least sometimes not one of Christians against Jews, but rather Christians allied with the vast majority of Jews who are respectable against the minority of Jews who are destructive.
3. **Leaders of today's Alphonsepogroms are Jews.** That Jews are in fact divided in their willingness to defend the destructive elements in their midst is attested to by the observation that the best-documented and most-scathing attacks on these destructive elements have come from Jews themselves — for example, from Israel Shahak, Norman Finkelstein, Noam Chomsky, Akiva Orr, John Sack, William J. Wolf, Boaz Evron, Yoram Sheftel, and Philip Roth. (Readers are able to discover where these individuals are cited within the Ukrainian Archive by using the Google internal search engine on the Ukrainian Archive home page.) Noting the underlying similarity between the 1905 *Alphonsepogrom* and the attack by Shahak, Finkelstein, Chomsky, Orr, Sack, Wolf, Evron, Sheftel, and Roth upon the destructive individuals among contemporary Jews, it is possible to view these seven — and others — as the leaders of a contemporary *Alphonsepogrom*, where we understand "Alphonsepogrom" to cover not only physical attack, but also to include criticism of Jewish misbehavior.
4. **Brothel owners in Slavic lands were mainly Jews.** Bristow refers to the following statement as a "wild story" and as "slanderous": "Most brothel owners are Jews with university education. All customers are Jewish. The girls are mostly servants — Christian." However, Bristow does not mean that every part of the statement is untrue. In fact, Bristow documents that in the Slavic world, brothels were owned almost exclusively by Jews. The parts of the statement for which there is no evidence and which are implausible are that the brothel owners had university educations, and that all customers were Jewish. On the question of whether the prostitutes were mostly Christian, the evidence is mixed — often Bristow presents data supporting this view, but sometimes he presents data supporting the opposite view — that most of the prostitutes were Jewish.

5. **How Jews can reduce anti-Semitism.** It is possible to imagine that some Slavic feelings of antipathy might be directed primarily toward the minority of Jews engaged in destructive activities, and might extend to Jews generally only upon the mistaken impression that Jews generally supported and defended these destructive activities. If this were the case, then a simple step toward reducing anti-Jewish feeling would be for the majority of Jews to disown and renounce the activities of the destructive minority sheltering among them.

6. **Slavs caught repeatedly in the same traps?** One wonders whether there might not be some application on a historical and inter-ethnic level of the aphorisms "Fool me once, shame on you; fool me twice, shame on me," and "He who is cheated twice by the same man is half as bad as the scoundrel." That is, if approximately one century ago Jews controlled prostitution in the Slavic world — which control, as Bristow documents, included the export of Slavic girls for sex slavery to foreign destinations — then perhaps it is symptomatic of a lack of historical awareness, or of a deficiency in the ability to avoid being caught twice in the same mistake, that the Slavs find themselves being victimized in a similar way today and by the same people.

7. **Will Jacob Golans ever become the victim of an Alphonsenpogrom?** One wonders whether something resembling the 1905 *Alphonsenpogrom* could occur within Israel today with respect to the [Jacob Golans](#) of Israel — the brothel owners who currently offer Ukrainian sex slaves as their big draws. Might Israelis tire of having their image smeared by the criminal element among them? Might Israelis tire of waiting for a corrupt police force, and a corrupt government, to clean up the notorious Israeli brothels? Might Israelis participate in a contemporary *Alphonsenpogrom*, ride their Jacob Golans out of town on a rail, and emancipate the Ukrainian sex slaves? If such a thing happened, it would contribute greatly toward improving Ukrainian perceptions of Israel and toward ameliorating Ukrainian-Jewish relations.

Brian Blomquist New York Post 08-Jan-2000 Hillary Rodham Clinton Soft on Trafficking in Women?

"A powerful coalition of feminists is gearing up to fight an effort by members of Hillary Rodham Clinton's women's commission to weaken laws on international trafficking of prostitutes." — Brian Blomquist

The [original of the article below](#) was published on the Internet by the [Coalition Against Trafficking in Women](#) (CATW) based at the [University of Rhode Island](#). The CATW has also prepared an [index of related documents](#).

This topic is relevant to the Ukrainian Archive not only because of the frequency with which the [victims](#) in the sex slave trade are Ukrainian, but also because of the [involvement](#) of Bill Clinton and the Rodham family with the [East European mafia](#), which of course conducts the international sex slave trade. Other articles on the Clinton's position on trafficking in women can be found in the PLUNDER WOMEN INDEX whose link appears at the top of the present page.

'HOOKER' PANEL PUTS FIRST LADY ON THE SPOT

By BRIAN BLOMQUIST
New York Post
08 January 2000

WASHINGTON — A powerful coalition of feminists is gearing up to fight an effort by members of Hillary Rodham Clinton's women's commission to weaken laws on international trafficking of prostitutes.

The coalition, which includes Patricia Ireland of the National Organization for Women and Ms. Magazine founder Gloria Steinem, sent a letter this week to the White House to protest the United States' proposal to get the United Nations to drop its condemnation of those who deal in prostitution.

Although the feminists steered their complaint away from the first lady, some religious-conservative opponents have targeted Clinton. The three State Department officials behind the effort to change the U.N. policy on prostitution trafficking — Anita Botti, Theresa Loar and Stephen Warnath — all have ties to Clinton. Botti and Loar sit on the President's Interagency Council on Women, which is chaired by Hillary Clinton. Warnath, who is counsel to Clinton's women's council, is one of the lead negotiators in favor of what some feminists see as a pro-prostitution position taken by the United States.

Equality Now President Jessica Neuwirth, who formed the nine-member feminist coalition that's opposing the weakened policy on prostitution, said she's "interested" in Clinton's role. "I'd like to know where she stands on it," Neuwirth said. Planned Parenthood President Gloria Feldt, who signed onto Neuwirth's letter, also wants to know where Clinton stands. "This is an issue that I believe will become larger," Feldt said. "Sex trafficking robs women of their most basic and fundamental rights."

The policy backed by Clinton's allies would condemn trafficking in international prostitution only when it can be proved that the prostitutes were forced or coerced into their selling their bodies. Clinton's spokesman, Howard Wolfson, said he didn't know if she supported the weakened proposal.

Bennet/Colson Wall Street Journal 10Jan2000 Clintons shrug at sex trafficking

"Over the last 10 years, the numbers of women and children that have been trafficked have multiplied so that they are now on a par with estimates of the numbers of Africans who were enslaved in the 16th and 17th centuries." — Laura J. Lederer

The [original of the article below](#) was published on the Internet by the [Coalition Against Trafficking in Women](#) (CATW) based at the [University of Rhode Island](#). The CATW has also prepared an [index of related documents](#).

This topic is relevant to the Ukrainian Archive not only because of the frequency with which the [victims](#) in the sex slave trade are Ukrainian, but also because of the [involvement](#) of Bill Clinton and the Rodham family with the [East European mafia](#), which of course conducts the international sex slave trade. Other articles on the Clinton's position on trafficking in women can be found in the PLUNDER WOMEN INDEX whose link appears at the top of the present page.

The Clintons Shrug at Sex Trafficking

Wall Street Journal, Monday, January 10, 2000

By William J. Bennett and Charles W. Colson

Over the past few months the Clinton administration has lobbied for the United Nations to adopt a protocol that would lend legitimacy to prostitution and hard-core pornography.

This effort has been spearheaded by the President's Interagency Council on Women, a group whose honorary chairman is none other than Hillary Rodham Clinton. Although the proposal has drawn opposition from across

the political spectrum, the administration is forging ahead with its plans. Whether it succeeds in these morally indefensible ambitions will depend on a crucial U.N. vote scheduled for later this month.

First some background. It's been estimated that each year some two million women and children world-wide are sent into lives of sexual bondage, usually as prostitutes. "Over the last 10 years, the numbers of women and children that have been trafficked have multiplied so that they are now on a par with estimates of the numbers of Africans who were enslaved in the 16th and 17th centuries," according to Laura J. Lederer of Harvard's John F. Kennedy School of Government. What we are dealing with, then, is a huge number of human-rights violations.

Yet in Vienna a week from today — when the U.N. Convention on Transnational Organized Crime votes on its protocol to combat international trafficking in women and children — White House representatives will take the first step toward legitimizing the sexual-trafficking business. Negotiations on this Vienna Protocol have been going on for the past year and a half. Since December, however, the White House delegation has worked to narrow the definition of sexual trafficking, in a way that would allow certain prostitution rings to flourish. It has done so despite the objections of a majority of the G-7 countries and other developing nations, whose women are the principal victims of sex trafficking.

Existing U.N. Convention

To secure its goal, the Clinton administration must effectively repeal an existing U.N. convention that strictly forbids prostitution and requires punishment of any person who "procures, entices or leads away, for the purposes of prostitution ... even with the consent of that person." The Clinton group also believes that international actions against pornography rings should be restricted to pornographers who work without the "consent" of the women they use, thereby granting the international pornography "industry" the sort of legitimacy and legal status it has long sought. Hillary Clinton has been quite active as the honorary chairman of the President's Interagency Council on Women, speaking out about the evils of sexual trafficking. In Reykjavik, Iceland, in October, she said: "No government and no citizen should rest until we stop this modern form of slavery, protect its victims and prosecute those who are responsible." But as is so often the case with the Clintons, what they do is at odds with what they say.

The White House position, should it prevail, would effectively ensure that prostitution and pornography would be treated as legitimate career options for women, as long as women "consent" to it and no force is involved. In defining the term sexual exploitation, the administration has supported using the phrase forced prostitution rather than simply prostitution. In this instance the adjective forced makes all the difference. If the administration's position is accepted, the focus of attention would shift from the profiteers who traffic in women to the supposed state of mind of the victimized women. It would create loopholes long sought by perpetrators, insulating them from criminal prosecution. "Practically speaking, this [new definition] is a virtual bar to prosecution," says J. Robert Flores, a former prosecutor with both the New York District Attorney and the U.S. Department of Justice.

Even if it were practical to distinguish between consent and force in such cases, the administration's position would still contradict common sense and decency. Prostitution and pornography inevitably exploit women, whether they consent to it or not. And it is not only conservatives who are opposed to the administration's policies in this matter.

In a stinging letter sent last week to Mr. Clinton, Gloria Steinem, Patricia Ireland, Eleanor Smeal and other feminist leaders wrote that "the definition of trafficking advocated by the administration would not cover some of the most common methods of sex trafficking which prey on and profit from the economic desperation of women, girls, and their families by securing their 'consent' to sale in prostitution." The letter goes on to explain why narrowing the definition of sexual trafficking will hurt, not help, potential victims.

These objections have been echoed by women's groups from Bangladesh to Ukraine, and by the European Women's Lobby, a human-rights coalition of more than 2,800 dues-paying member organizations. They recognize what the Clinton administration does not: There can be no meaningful "consent" to one's own sexual exploitation — particularly when one lives in poverty and desperate circumstances.

The Clinton administration purports to be pro-woman. Nevertheless, in addition to its effort to weaken the Vienna Protocol, the administration has steadfastly opposed the Trafficking Victims Protection Act. This bipartisan legislation was passed unanimously by the House International Relations Committee, with the support of a broad coalition of religious, human-rights and women's groups. The legislation's definition of sex

trafficking would include any "purchase, sale, recruitment, harboring, transportation, transfer or receipt of a person for the purpose of a commercial sex act."

End to U.S. Subsidies

Mrs. Clinton's Council on Women has opposed the bill because it allegedly imposes "mandatory sanctions" on countries that do not prosecute the most severe forms of trafficking. This is a double standard; the administration supports sanctions against countries that do not adhere to other, far less important standards of commercial conduct. And it is dishonest. The bill requires that the president either end nonhumanitarian foreign aid to offending countries or provide such assistance pursuant to a waiver. The only "sanction" is an end to U.S. subsidies, and even this sanction is not mandatory.

What, then, needs to be done? First, the Clinton administration should see to it that the Vienna delegation's position is reversed forthwith, well before the final Jan. 17 vote. Second, Congress should uncover the reasons why the administration has taken the current position. Third, the administration should cease its opposition to the Trafficking Victims Protection Act.

The reasons for the Clinton administration's course of action are hard to fathom. What is certain is that if it does not reverse its course, its actions in Vienna will be counted as yet one more shameful act committed by this deeply corrupt administration.

Mr. Bennett is co-director of *Empower America*. Mr. Colson is chairman of *Prison Fellowship Ministries*

Stewart Bell National Post 18-May-2000 Israel still enslaves Slavic women

"Many women are subjected to violence, including rape. Yet most of the people who commit such human rights abuses are never brought to justice by the Israeli government." — Amnesty International

The [National Post](#) article below is available online. See also the [Ha'aretz](#) report of 18-May-2000. An [Amnesty International](#) news release also outlines this report.

Thursday, May 18, 2000

Abuse of imported prostitutes ignored: Amnesty

Police should target pimps and not their victims, report says

Stewart Bell

National Post

ISRAEL - A new report by Amnesty International accuses Israel of failing to protect the human rights of women and girls imported from the former Soviet Union to work in the country's booming sex trade.

Recruited in Eastern Europe by underworld agents, the women are treated as commodities, bought and sold by pimps and traffickers for thousands of dollars and held in debt slavery, said the report to be released today.

"They are locked up in apartments and have their passports and travel tickets confiscated," it said. "Many women are subjected to violence, including rape. Yet most of the people who commit such human rights abuses are never brought to justice by the Israeli government."

Amnesty said it was concerned that governments are treating the global phenomenon of trafficking in women simply as a criminal and immigration problem rather than a human rights abuse.

Many women trafficked into Israel end up detained in police lock-ups or at the Neve Tirza prison following raids on brothels and massage parlours, and are rarely released on bail pending deportation, said the report.

Canada, which is playing an emerging role in the international human trafficking industry, has faced similar accusations. Advocacy groups want police to target the traffickers rather than the women and children, who are often coerced into prostitution and crime.

During a year-long operation called Project Almonzo, police in the Toronto area have laid more than 650 charges against women and club owners. The women are mostly from Eastern Europe, Asia and Latin America.

Authorities view the trade in women as a result of globalization, which has been accompanied by an increase in economic migration from poor to developed nations. A report published by the Central Intelligence Agency estimated up to two million women and children are trafficked around the world annually.

The Amnesty report cites the case of Anna, a 31-year-old Russian physics teacher "lured" to Israel to work in the sex industry for 20 times her teaching salary. Her passport was taken and she was locked in an apartment with six others, the report said. She was sold at auction twice, the second time for US\$10,000.

Tatiana, another woman cited in the report, came to Israel from Belarus to work in a hotel to help support her mother and six-year-old son, but was forced to work in a brothel until it was raided by police.

The human rights group acknowledges that Israel has taken steps to improve the situation, including the passage of legislation in March that states that all women are entitled to protection from violence and trafficking. The justice ministry is also drafting a provision to criminalize the buying and selling of people, the report said.

But Amnesty says the government still fails to protect trafficked women from human rights abuses. The rights group said Israel should work more closely with the former Soviet bloc countries and needs a strategy to coordinate government agencies to combat abuses.

"Both the government and the traffickers are treating these women as if they do not have human rights. The authorities have a responsibility to take action to protect these trafficked women from enslavement, imprisonment and violence."

The United Nations Human Rights Committee warned in 1998 that "women brought to Israel for the purposes of prostitution ... are not protected as victims of trafficking but are likely to bear the penalties of their illegal presence in Israel by deportation."

Suzanne Goldenberg The Guardian 16-Aug-2000 The dead women came from Ukraine

"Social workers believe the dead women came from Ukraine, where most of those brought from the former soviet Union for prostitution are from." — Suzanne Goldenberg

Four die in Tel Aviv brothel attack

Special report: Israel and the Middle East

Suzanne Goldenberg in Jerusalem

Wednesday August 16, 2000

Police in Tel Aviv are hunting a serial arsonist attacking the city's sex industry after the horrific death of four women, locked inside a brothel which was set on fire overnight.

The attack, said by social workers to be the sixth of its kind in a week, added to the debate on the increasing traffic in women for prostitution by Russian and Israeli gangs, and the appalling treatment they suffer.

Social workers believe the dead women came from Ukraine, where most of those brought from the former soviet Union for prostitution are from.

The police said they were investigating the possibility that the fire might have been started by ultra-Orthodox Jews opposed to the sex industry.

"We are pursuing a number of courses of inquiry, both the possibility of a dispute between operators of these businesses and ... that extremist ultra-Orthodox Jews are responsible," the chief of police, Shlomo Aharonishky, said.

Earlier this year Amnesty International reported that 10,000 women from the former Soviet Union had been virtually enslaved in Israel in the past 10 years. Many have forged documents identifying them as Jewish immigrants.

Promised earnings of \$1,000 (£665) a month, they are routinely confined to flats, deprived of their passports, beaten and threatened with arrest as illegal immigrants.

Women's organisations say the police have become more aware of their plight in the past six months. Until recently the authorities have been reluctant to prosecute the men involved, although 400 women are detained and deported every year.

Although most of them know they are coming to work as prostitutes, about 30% of the women arrive in response to job advertisements in Russian papers

for waitresses and nurses, the Israeli Coalition
against Trafficking in Women says.

The jews are our misfortune!
